| UNITED STATES DISTRICT COURT SOUTHERN DISTRICT OF NEW YORK | DOC #:X DATE FILED: 12/10/2019 |
|--|---------------------------------|
| STATE OF NEW YORK, et al., | |
| Plaintiffs, | : 19-cv-5434 (VM) (RWL) : |
| - against - | : ORDER |
| DEUTSCHE TELEKOM, AG, et al., | : : |
| Defendants. | : : |
| | X |

FILED

ROBERT W. LEHRBURGER, United States Magistrate Judge.

Non-parties Altice, AT&T and Comcast seek to maintain the confidentiality at trial of certain documents. This Court previously has directed the parties and non-parties to pare down any such requests to only those that would pass muster under Second Circuit standards. The parties and non-parties have worked assiduously to do so. The Court already has ruled with respect to Altice documents. Accordingly, this Order addresses the AT&T and Comcast documents, which were discussed during a telephone conference held on December 10, 2019. The Court has reviewed each document at issue. Having considered each document, the parties' submissions and arguments, prior proceedings, the presumption of public access to judicial documents, the status of AT&T and Comcast as non-parties, and the Second Circuit standards set forth in Lugosch v. Pyramid Company of Onondaga, 435 F.3d 110 (2d Cir. 2006), the Court determines as follows:

COMCAST DOCUMENTS

The following documents may be maintained as confidential at trial (identified by Bates number of the first page of the document):

| 27807 |
|---|
| 29794 |
| 1690 |
| The following documents should be redacted so that only confidential |
| material, if any, is redacted from public disclosure: |
| 27230 |
| 31662 (appears to be summary of information presented by third parties and of general |
| trends, none of which should be maintained as confidential) |
| 33419 (much of this appears to be from JPMorgan report; only interlineated comments of |
| Comcast personnel potentially may be maintained as confidential) |
| 18713 |
| 19629 |
| 58961 |
| 58965 |
| 22617 (appears to be report provided by third-party data reporting numbers that are |
| available to anyone who pays to receive the data; if so, none of this may be maintained |
| as confidential) |
| 36561 |
| 36710 |
| 36733 |
| Any of the Comcast documents not listed above shall not be maintained as |
| confidential. |

AT&T DOCUMENTS

The following documents may be maintained as confidential at trial (identified by Bates number of the first page of the document):

N.A.

The following documents should be redacted so that only the confidential material, if any, is redacted from public disclosure:

147567

167878

135464

6902

34269

37371

165967

Any of the AT&T documents not listed above shall not be maintained as confidential.

To be clear, the exchange of information between AT&T's Executive Vice President of Regulatory Affairs and the Policy Director of AT&T's largest union may not be maintained as confidential at trial.

SO ORDERED.

ROBERT W. LEHRBURGER

UNITED STATES MAGISTRATE JUDGE

Dated:

December 10, 2019 New York, New York

Copies transmitted to: all counsel of record via ECF.